



Utah State Board of Education

Meeting Minutes

December 7, 2023, Board Meeting
9:00 AM. – 6:50 PM.

A regular Utah State Board of Education meeting was held on December 7, 2023. Chair Moss presided. As Utah Code 52-4 authorized, this meeting was held at the state board offices, 250 E. 500 S, Salt Lake City, Utah. The public can view the discussion through live YouTube streaming.

Members Present

Board Chair James Moss
First Vice-Chair Molly Hart
Second Vice-Chair Jennie Earl
Member Kristan Norton
Member Natalie Cline
Member LeAnn Wood
Member Sarah Reale

Member Carol Barlow Lear
Member Matt Hymas
Member Christina Boggess
Member Randy Boothe
Member Brent J. Strate
Member Emily Green
Member Joseph Kerry

Members Absent

Member Cindy Davis

Executive Staff Present

Sydnee Dickson, State Superintendent
Sarah Young, Chief of Staff
Patty Norman, Deputy Superintendent
Scott Jones, Deputy Superintendent
Angie Stallings, Deputy Superintendent
Kelsey James, Board Communications Coordinator

Minutes were taken by:

Cybil Prideaux, Executive Assistant

Public Participants

Lexi Cunningham, Monica Wilbur, Renee Pinkney, Shane Jones, CJ Wilkinson, Julie Cluff, Briawna Hug, Laurel Fetzer, Royce Van Tassel, and April Wilde Despain.

Opening Business

Chair Moss called the meeting to order at 9:11 AM.

1.1. Member Brent Strate led the Pledge of Allegiance.

1.2. Board Member Message

Board Member Brent State offered inspirational thoughts and welcoming thoughts for December.

2. Superintendent's Report

2.1 INFORMATION: Employee Recognition

Superintendent Dickson introduced Cathy Davis, the December Employee of the Month.

2.2 INFORMATION: Acknowledgement of Student Artwork

2.3 INFORMATION: Superintendent's Report
Superintendent Dickson

3. Public Comment for USBE - 9:45 to 10:15 AM

The public is welcome to send written comments to publiccomment@schools.utah.gov.

3.1 INFORMATION: Public Comment

- Public comments are limited to 2 minutes per person.
- A comment can express support or dissent for regulatory action.
- Individuals should not use public comment to complain about personnel issues or attack or defame an individual.
- Speakers making highly detailed or complex comments should also consider providing a written outline of their words to the Board.
- Please remember that children may hear your comments. Be thoughtful and professional.

- Keep your comments appropriate for a general audience. If you have material with explicit language or content, submit such material in writing to the Board at publiccomments@schools.utah.gov

The Board heard public comments from the following individuals:

Lexi Cunningham
Monica Wilbur
Renée Pinkney
Shane Jones
CJ Wilkinson
Julie Cluff
Briawna Hugh
Laurel Fetzer
April Wilde Despain

4. USDB Board Meeting

4.1. Carry Forward Discussion

4.2. Monthly Budget Update as of October 31, 2023

4.3. DeafBlind Division Presentation

Ms. Patten, Associate Superintendent of the Blind, presented on the DeafBlind division.

4.4. Superintendent's Report

4.5. Contract for Approval

MOTION was made by Member Hymas and seconded by Member Green that the Board approve the USDB Ogden Campus admin restroom contract.

The motion passed unanimously.

5 Finance Committee Report/Recommendations (Items duplicated from the November 3, 2023 meeting)

The Committee Chair, Kristan Norton, shared the committee motions.

5.1 INFORMATION: November 3, 2023, Summary of Actions

5.2 INFORMATION: Public Comment

5.3 ACTION: Resolution Establishing the Official Position of the Utah State Board of Education Regarding School Trust Lands and Funds

No motion for the Board.

5.4 ACTION: Related to Basic Program Review and/or Recommendations

MOTION was made by Member Norton that the Board recommends to the legislature to consider consolidating the Elementary School Counselor Program and the Student Health and Counseling Support Program while preserving the allocation for elementary schools through the application process.

The motion carried with Members Green, Kerry, Cline, and Boggess opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Norton that the Board recommends that the legislature continue the Digital Teaching and Learning Program as a separate funding item.

The motion failed with Members Lear, Norton, Moss, Strate, Boothe, Reale, and Kerry in favor and with Members Hymas, Boggess, Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, and Wood opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Strate and seconded by Member Lear that the Board recommend the Digital Teaching and Learning Program as a separate funding item and to add a growth index.

SUBSTITUTE MOTION was made by Member Hymas and seconded by Member Boggess that the Board recommends the Legislature roll the Digital Teaching and Learning Program into the WPU.

MOTION TO REFER was made by Member Hart and seconded by Member Strate that the Board refer the Digital Teaching and Learning Program agenda item back to the Finance Committee and the entire Board later the same day as a part of the Board's study session.

The motion carried with Members Strate, Wood, Earl, Hart, Moss, Earl, Boothe, and Reale in favor and Members Boggess, Norton, Hymas, Cline, Kerry, and Green opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Norton that the Board recommends that the legislature create a timeline to fund transportation at 100 percent of eligible costs in light of new efficiency models.

The motion carried with Member Cline opposed, and Member Boggess abstained.

MOTION was made by Member Norton that the Board recommends that the legislature hold on to a decision to move the Title I Paraeducators out of the base budget until the growth is determined from new federal policies.

SUBSTITUTE MOTION was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Moss that the Board recommends that the Legislature include the Title I Paraeducators funding into the final education budget bill.

The motion passed unanimously.

MOTION was made by Member Norton that the Board recommends that the legislature move the Early Literacy item into the Basic School Program, maintaining the integrity of the K-3 Early Literacy program with an earmark.

The motion carried with Member Cline abstained.

5.5 ACTION: Recommend Reallocation of Unobligated Carry Forward Funds to the Legislature

MOTION was made by Member Norton that the Board requests that the legislature reallocate a portion of the \$7.7 million unobligated agency carry forward for priorities:

#8 – Special Education Funding for LEAs - \$1.7 million, and

#11 – San Juan School District Tribal Student Network Project Maintenance - \$2.5 million

The motion carried with Members Cline, Boggess, Green, and Hymas opposed.

5.6 INFORMATION: Recognition of Progress, Achievements, or Improvements

5.6.1 INFORMATION: Progress Update on School Finance Dashboards

5.6.2 INFORMATION: Program Monthly Report (PMR) on the Utah Schools Information Management System

- 5.6.3 INFORMATION: Program Monthly Report (PMR) on Utah Grants
- 5.7 INFORMATION: Special Education Program Code for Expenditures from Unrestricted Funds
- 5.8 INFORMATION: Requests for Data and Information
- 5.9 INFORMATION: Progress Update on Governor's Recommendations for School Construction
- 5.10 INFORMATION: Adding a Priority Academic Area to School LAND Trust

6 Law and Licensing Committee Report/Recommendations – 11:45 to 12:15 PM (Items duplicated from the November 3, 2023 meeting)

The Committee Chair, Matt Hymas, shared the committee motions.

- 6.1 INFORMATION: November 3, 2023, Summary of Actions
- 6.2 ACTION: R277-925, Effective Teachers in High Poverty Schools Incentive Program (Amendment)

MOTION was made by Member Hymas that the Board approve R277-925, Effective Teachers in High Poverty Schools Incentive Program, Draft 2, on the second and final reading.

The motion carried with Member Hart absent.
- 6.3 ACTION: R277-126, Utah Fits All Scholarship Appeals (New)

MOTION was made by Member Hymas that the Board approve R277-126, Utah Fits All Scholarship Appeals, Draft 2, on the second and final reading.

The motion passed unanimously. Member Hart was absent.
- 6.4 DISCUSSION: Data Sharing for Charter School Marketing and Potential Amendments to R277-487, Public School Data Confidentiality and Disclosure
- 6.5 DISCUSSION: USDB Allowing Siblings of Deaf and Hard of Hearing Students to Attend a USD Campus Program
- 6.6 INFORMATION: Meaningful Inclusion of Students with Disabilities

7. Standards and Assessment Committee Report/Recommendations – 12:15 to 12:45 PM (Items duplicated from the November 3, 2023 meeting)

The Committee Chair, Randy Boothe, shared the committee motions.

7.1 INFORMATION: November 3, 2023, Summary of Actions

7.2 INFORMATION: Public Comment

7.3 INFORMATION: Recognition of Progress, Achievements, or Improvements

7.4 INFORMATION: Advanced Placement (AP) Results for School Year 2022-2023

7.5 ACTION: CTE Course Standards Approval

See motion below

8. Break

9. Standards and Assessment Committee Report/Recommendations – 1:15 to 2:15 PM (Items duplicated from the November 14, 28, and 30, 2023 meetings)

The Committee Chair, Randy Boothe, shared the committee motions.

9.1 INFORMATION: November 14, November 28, and November 30, 2023, Summary of Actions

9.2 ACTION: CTE Course Standards Approval

MOTION was made by Member Boothe that the Board approve as amended, including any technical changes:

1. Agricultural Science I
2. Agricultural Science II
3. Animal Science I
4. Animal Science II
5. Equine Science 1
6. Equine Science 2
7. Guide Dog Training
8. Small & Companion Animal Science
9. Veterinary Assistant 1
10. Veterinary Assistant 2
11. Food Products and Processing
12. Sports and Outdoor Recreation Marketing
13. Network Fundamentals

14. Mechanical Engineering Design 3
15. Emergency Medical Technician
16. Emergency Medical Response
17. Nurse Assistant
18. Pharmacy Technician
19. Surgical Technician
20. Cosmetology
21. Nail Technician
22. Basic Esthetician and Skin Care
23. Hair Design
24. Machining 1
25. Machining 2
26. Machining 3
27. Professional Driver
28. CTE Internship
29. Food and Nutrition
30. Architectural Design 1
31. Architectural Design 2
32. Architectural Design 3
33. Digital Audio 1
34. Digital Audio 2
35. Radio Production 1
36. Radio Production 2
37. Commercial Photography 1
38. Computer Systems 1
39. Computer Systems 2
40. Network Fundamentals
41. Introduction to 3D Printing
42. Teaching as a Profession 1
43. Mechanical Engineering Design 1
44. Mechanical Engineering Design 2
45. Mechanical Engineering Design 3
46. Fire Science, Introduction
47. Fire Science, Safety and Survival
48. Fire Science, Fire Behavior and Combustion
49. Business Office Specialist
50. Business Math & Personal Finance
51. Digital Business Applications
52. Economics
53. Influencer & Content Marketing
54. Real Estate
55. Professional Driver
56. Aviation Maintenance 1
57. Aviation Maintenance 2

- 58. Aviation History
- 59. Air Transportation
- 60. Aircraft Systems
- 61. Private Pilot

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Wood and seconded that the Board will motion to divide out the following courses -

- Commercial Photography 1
- Economics
- Teaching as a Profession 1
- Fire Science, Introduction
- Fire Science, Safety and Survival

SUBSTITUTE MOTION was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Green to divide 1-61.

The motion carried with Members Norton, Reale, Wood, Lear, Boothe, Moss, Hymas, Kerry, Cline, Hart, and Strate opposed and Members Boggess and Green in favor.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Wood and seconded that the Board will motion to divide out the following courses -

- Commercial Photography 1
- Economics
- Teaching as a Profession 1
- Fire Science, Introduction
- Fire Science, Safety and Survival

The motion passed unanimously.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Strate that the Board approve the language of the writing committee in Commercial Photography 1

- Commercial Photography 1

STRAND 6: Portfolio Students will construct a digital portfolio to demonstrate their development in aesthetic literacy and curate their own work using through compositional elements. The portfolio will serve as an assessment of student understanding through hands-on, process-based learning of each concept listed.

The motion carried with Members Hymas, Boggess, Moss, Green, and Cline opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Green that the Board strike “aesthetic literacy through” from all Commercial Photography 1, STRANDs.

The motion failed with Members Green, Cline, Boggess, and Kerry in favor.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Reale to approve the Standards for Commercial Photography 1, as amended.

The motion carried with Member Boggess opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Reale that the Board approve Economics Strand 3, Standard 1 to adopt the graphic as designed by the writing committee.

The motion failed with Members Cline, Boggess, Green, Kerry, Moss, and Hymas opposed. Member Earl abstained.

MOTION was made by Member Strate and seconded by Member Wood that the Board remove the graphic in Strand 3, Standard 1 from the Economics CTE Course.

The motion carried with Member Reale opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Strate that the Board approve the Economics CTE Course, as amended.

The motion carried with Member Boggess opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Strate that the Board approve all instances of the following language be changed in Teaching as a Profession 1 STRAND 2 (Standards 2-6) Strike the first “and apply to student learning outcomes” and “some in education believe they relate” and insert “they apply” or “it applies” in Teaching as a Profession 1.

The motion carried with Members Boggess, Cline, Hymas, and Green opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Hart that the Board amend language in Teaching 1, STRAND 4, STANDARD 3 to adopt the writing committee draft language regarding the definition of summative assessment.

The motion carried with Members Cline, Strate, Kerry, Hymas, Green, and Boggess opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Wood that the Board adds a bullet point in the Teaching Course, Strand 2, Standard 2 as follows:

- Understand ~~the difference between learning styles and multiple intelligences and~~ how presenting information in different ways can help students retain information.

The motion carried, and Member Lear abstained.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Strate that the Board strike “towards achieving state standards.” and insert “essential educational skills and knowledge.” in Strand 4, Standard 2 of the Teaching Course.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Kerry and seconded by Member Earl that the Board add “comply with applicable state standards” after the word “knowledge.” as follows:
essential educational skills and knowledge that comply with applicable state standards.

The motion failed with Members Earl, Kerry, Hymas, Boggess, and Hart in favor.

SUBSTITUTE MOTION was made by Member Reale and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board adopt the language presented by the writing committee in Strand 4 Standard 2 “Progress: forward movement toward a learning intention.”

The motion carried with Members Boggess, Cline, Green, and Kerry opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board adopt the Teaching as a Profession 1 Course, as amended.

The motion carried with Members Cline, Boggess, and Green opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Strate that the Board substitute the following language, “Discuss how firefighters hold a position of public trust.” in Fire Science, Safety and Survival Course, Strand 2, Standard 4.

The motion carried with Members Hymas, Cline, Boggess, and Green opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Strate that the Board adopt

the Fire Science, Safety and Survival Course.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Green that the Board strike “National Fire Academy” in Strand 5, Standard 3 in Fire Science Introduction.

The motion carried with Members Reale, Norton, Lear, Wood, and Strate opposed. Member Kerry was absent.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Strate that the Board adopt the Fire Science, Introduction, as amended.

The motion carried with Member Boggess opposed. Member Kerry was absent.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boggess that the Board strike the four bullet points in Strand 1, Standard 3 after “examine some of the reasons why people resist change.”

The motion carried with members Boggess, Cline, Moss, and Green in favor. Member Kerry was absent.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Lear that the Board adopt the following substitute language: “Explore examples of other industries that have used leadership, management, and supervision to develop components of safety culture and how those examples can be used to improve safety within fire service.”

The motion carried with Members Cline and Boggess opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Strate that the Board I move to adopt the language as submitted by the writing committee from the Performance Skill Strand 2.

The motion carried with Member Boggess opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Strate that the Board adopt the Fire Science, Safety and Survival course, as amended.

The motion carried with Members Boggess and Cline opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boggess that the Board

strike "Workplace Skills" from the CTE courses as follows:

- Communication
- Problem Solving
- Teamwork
- Critical Thinking
- Dependability
- Accountability
- Legal Requirements/expectations

The motion failed with Members Boggess and Cline in favor. Member Kerry was absent.

FINAL MOTION that the Board approve the below CTE Course Standards, Draft 2 as amended, including any technical changes:

1. Agricultural Science I
2. Agricultural Science II
3. Animal Science I
4. Animal Science II
5. Equine Science 1
6. Equine Science 2
7. Guide Dog Training
8. Small & Companion Animal Science
9. Veterinary Assistant 1
10. Veterinary Assistant 2
11. Food Products and Processing
12. Sports and Outdoor Recreation Marketing
13. Network Fundamentals
14. Mechanical Engineering Design 3
15. Emergency Medical Technician
16. Emergency Medical Response
17. Nurse Assistant
18. Pharmacy Technician
19. Surgical Technician
20. Cosmetology
21. Nail Technician
22. Basic Esthetician and Skin Care
23. Hair Design
24. Machining 1
25. Machining 2
26. Machining 3
27. Professional Driver
28. CTE Internship

29. Food and Nutrition
30. Architectural Design 1
31. Architectural Design 2
32. Architectural Design 3
33. Digital Audio 1
34. Digital Audio 2
35. Radio Production 1
36. Radio Production 2
37. Computer Systems 1
38. Computer Systems 2
39. Network Fundamentals
40. Introduction to 3D Printing
41. Mechanical Engineering Design 1
42. Mechanical Engineering Design 2
43. Mechanical Engineering Design 3
44. Fire Science, Fire Behavior and Combustion
45. Business Office Specialist
46. Business Math & Personal Finance
47. Digital Business Applications
48. Influencer & Content Marketing
49. Real Estate
50. Professional Driver
51. Aviation Maintenance 1
52. Aviation Maintenance 2
53. Aviation History
54. Air Transportation
55. Aircraft Systems
56. Private Pilot

The motion carried with Members Boggess and Cline opposed.

10. 2024 General Session Legislation Preparation

10.1 ACTION: Process for Board Requested Legislative Funding

The Board took no action.

10.2 ACTION: Requests for Statutory Changes

MOTION was made by Member Hart and seconded by Member Reale that the Board directs staff to work with legislators on potential amendments to the Utah Code as proposed.

1. Amend Section 53G-7-602 to include the International Baccalaureate

program to align the textbook requirements of early college programs.

The motion carried with Members Earl, Kerry, Hart, Green, and Wood opposed.
Member Cline abstained.

MOTION was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boggess that the Board rescinds Amend Section 53G-10-205 to be consistent with the provisions of Section 53G-6-801 and 53G-6-803, including renumbering 53G-10-205 to be moved into Title 53G, Chapter 6, Part 8, Parental Rights.

SUBSTITUTE MOTION was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Reale that the Board amend the Board's #12 request for statutory change to read "Amend 53G-6-802 to add a requirement for LEAs to notify parents of the rights described in that part and in Section 53G-10-205."

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Boggess and seconded that the Board amend the above motion to read as follows: That the Board amend statutory require #12 to read "Amend Section 53G-6-802 to renumber a portion of a new Subsection (1) and a new Subsection (1)(b) "(1)(b) "constitutional protections in Section 53G-10-205".

In context:

1. An LEA shall annually notify a parent of a student enrolled in the LEA of:
 - a. the parent's rights as specified in this part; and
 - b. the constitutional protections in Section 53G-10-205.

The motion carried with Member Cline opposed.

MOTION TO POSTPONE was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Strate that the Board postpone the remaining agenda items.

The motion failed with Members Boothe, Kerry, Earl, Moss, Lear, Cline, and Hymas in favor and Members Boggess, Reale, Hart, Norton, Wood, Strate and Green opposed. Tie vote.

11. Reports and Requirements Task Force Recommendations

11.1 ACTION: Annual Training Requirements Reduction Request

- Postponed to the December 8, 2023, board meeting.

11.2 ACTION: Other Reports & Requirements Task Force Recommendations

- Postponed to the December 8, 2023, board meeting.

12. Monthly Budget Report

12.1 INFORMATION: Monthly Budget Report

Deputy Superintendent of Operations Scott Jones presented the Board of Education's monthly budget report. In accordance with the Money Management Act and the Budgetary Procedures Act, the Utah State Board of Education provided information on the status of funds for their internal budgets.

12.2 INFORMATION: Discretionary Funds Report

Deputy Superintendent of Operations Scott Jones presented the Board of Education discretionary fund report. Deborah Jacobson, Assistant Superintendent, updated the Board on the FY2022 P-12 Discretionary Funds account. Per the Money Management Act and the Budgetary Procedures Act, the Utah State Board of Education is provided with the status of the funds.

12.3 INFORMATION: Mid-Year Updates

13. General Consent Calendar

MOTION was made by Member Hart and seconded that the Board approve the Consent Calendar, minus the items pulled from the Consent Calendar.

The motion carried with Members Boggess, Green, and Cline opposed.

13.1 ACTION: Contracts/Agreements for Approval

The Board approves the monthly Consent Calendar.

13.1.1 ACTION: BTS Arts FY24 Budget Spend Out Plan

The Board approves to allocate the remaining available funds for FY24 after funding salaries and basic programs to support hiring LEA staff, providing supplies and materials, updating the BTS Arts Strategic Plan, and additional professional learning for BTS Arts Educators within the BTS Arts program.

13.2 INFORMATION: Contracts/Agreements for Review

13.3 INFORMATION: Intermountain Community Care Foundation Grant Award

13.4 ACTION: Approval of the Fall 2023 Instructional Materials Commission Report

The Board approved the Fall 2023 Instructional Materials Commission Report.

Member Cline requested that the meeting minutes be pulled from the consent calendar.

13.5 ACTION: Approval of Meeting Minutes

MOTION was made by Member Hart and seconded that the Board approve the meeting minutes.

The motion passed unanimously.

14. Board Member Comments

15. Executive Session (closed in accordance with the Utah Open and Public Meetings Act)

The motion was made by Member Wood and seconded that the Board move into executive session for the purpose of 1) discussing the purchase, exchange, or lease of real property; 2) discussing the character and professional competence or physical or mental health of individuals; and 3) strategy on pending or reasonably imminent litigation.

Upon voice vote of Members Boggess, Boothe, Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, Lear, Moss, Norton, Reale, Strate, Hymas, Kerry, and Wood, the Board went into closed session at 6:17 PM.

Upon voice vote of all Members, the Board went into closed session.

Those present included the above members: Sydnee Dickson, Cybil Prideaux, Kelsey James, Michelle Beus, Angie Stallings, and Ashley Biehl.

15.1 ACTION: Executive Session (see below)

MOTION was made by Member Earl, seconded by Member Hart, that the Board come out of executive session at 6:47 PM.

Motion carried.

16. Executive Session Action Items – 5:15 to 5:30 PM

16.1 ACTION: Educator Licenses

MOTION was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board approve the UPPAC consent calendar.

The motion passed unanimously.

MOTION was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board that the Board approves the recommendation of UPPAC in cases:

- Case No. 22-1933

The motion carried with Member Cline opposed.

MOTION TO POSTPONE was made by Member Earl and seconded.

The motion passed unanimously.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 6:50 PM.

Executive Assistant Cybil Prideaux. took minutes.

The minutes were approved January 11, 2024.