

**UTAH STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION**  
**MEETING MINUTES**

A regular meeting of the Utah State Board of Education was held on October 6, 2022, at 250 E 500 S, Salt Lake City, Utah. Chair Huntsman and Vice-chair Belnap presided.

The public could watch the meeting through the YouTube media channel <https://www.youtube.com/c/USBEMedia>

**Members Present:**

Chair Mark Huntsman	Member Molly Hart
Vice-chair Laura Belnap	Member Matt Hymas
Vice-chair Cindy Davis	Member Carol Lear
Member Janet Cannon	Member James Moss Jr.
Member Natalie Cline	Member Kristan Norton
Member Jennie Earl	Member Brent Strate
Member Scott Hansen	Member Randy Boothe
Member Stacey Hutchings	

**Executive Staff Present:**

Sydnee Dickson, State Superintendent  
Scott Jones, Deputy Superintendent  
Patty Norman, Deputy Superintendent  
Angie Stallings, Deputy Superintendent  
Sarah Young, Chief of Staff

**Minutes taken by:**

Cybil Child, Executive Assistant

**Opening Business**

Chair Huntsman called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

**Board Member Message**

Board Member Hymas shared thoughts from Stoics - Epictetus, Enchiridion, 28, Marcus Aurelius, Meditations, 6.21, and Epictetus, Discourses, 1.2.37b. The quotes he shared from Marcus Aurelius and Epictetus were great reminders of the power of the mind in the attempt to improve reaching education goals.

### Education Highlight

Kelsey James, Board Communications Coordinator highlighted the Utah Blue Ribbons Schools who received the award from the Utah Department of Education: Adams Elementary in Logan School District and Horizon Elementary in Washington School District.

### Public Comment for USBE

- Public comments are limited to 2 minutes per person.
- A comment can express simple support or dissent for regulatory action.
- Individuals should not use public comment to complain about personnel issues or attack or defame an individual.
- Speakers making a highly detailed or complex comment should also consider providing a written outline of their words to the Board.
- Please remember that children may hear your comments. Be thoughtful and professional.
- Keep your comments appropriate for a general audience. If you have material with explicit language or content, submit such material in writing to the Board at [publiccomments@schools.utah.gov](mailto:publiccomments@schools.utah.gov)

### Public Participants

- Debra Coe spoke in favor of the SHARP Survey.
- Binee Larsen, representing the Utah Suicide Prevention Coalition's Executive Committee, spoke in favor of the SHARP Survey and encouraged the Board to support the SHARP survey.
- Marina Lowe spoke in favor of the SHARP Survey.
- Joe Johnson spoke about his concerns about library-sensitive materials.
- France Barral, representing the Utah Parent and Teacher Association (PTA), spoke about budgetary priorities

- Sara Jones, Utah Education Association (UEA), spoke about the Board's prioritization for paid professionals.
- Brent Bills spoke about the proposed changes to R277-911 and requested lines 579-600 to be addressed.
- Dave Gardner spoke about the proposed changes to R277-911.
- Monica Wilbur spoke against the SHARP survey about the effectiveness of the results.
- Steve Sparti spoke about the Alpine School District's public comments.
- Andrea Hinton, a parent of children in Alpine School District, spoke about the benefits of full-day kindergarten.

### [State Superintendent's Report](#)

#### Acknowledgment of Student Artwork

Cathy Jensen, USBE Education Specialist for Fine Arts, Music, and Theatre, presented the student artwork.

#### New Employee Introductions

Michelle Watts, Human Resources Director introduced the new employees: Adam Weinstein, Stephanie Christensen, Danielle Macias, Lorraine Peterson, Kody Wright, Riley Finnegan, Saige Bowman, Jennifer Prince, Katrina Stratford, Andrea Mortensen, Meghan Everette, Jessica Lamb, Brooke Marsh, Janet Scott, Carson Miller, Spencer Banks, Courtney Barilec, Brittan Donaldson, Shari Smith, Cassie Gaisford, McKenna Maguet, Amy Bolton, Harmony Langford, and Heather Ripley.

### Employee Recognition

State Superintendent Sydnee Dickson recognized the September Employee of the Month, Kate Wheeler.

### Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Dickson congratulated ETC Education Specialist Kristina Yamada and Humanities Coordinator Robert Austin for their recognition of the Excellence in Ethics Award. She recognized Chad Warnick as the 2023 Utah Teacher of the Year and she updated the Board about the 2022 Educator Engagement Survey about educators' value, closed-ended response data summary: positive and negative responses. October is National Principals Month and she honored the North and South Sanpete school leadership.

### Board Chair's Report

Board Chair Huntsman addressed Computer Science in Utah. In 2018, the computer Science Tech Task Force was created. In 2019, Governor Herbert signed House Bill 227, the Utah computer Science Grant Act and since 2019 only 54% of public high schools have taught computer science. He also recognized that Utah Tech University would induct alumni Sydnee Dickson and Steven Snow into the Hall of Fame in recognition of their contributions to the state of Utah.

Dickson has been an educator for over four decades, serving as the Utah state superintendent of public instruction since 2016. She oversees a public education system of more than 670,000 students and developed and implemented state initiatives such as Dual Language Immersion and Digital Teaching and Learning.

Additionally, she collaborated with legislators to secure record education funding and improved education policies. Her prior education experience includes teaching, school counseling, school and district administration and state policy work.

Dickson earned an associate degree from then-named Dixie Junior College, where she was a two-year Rebelette and served on student activity and advisory committees. She went on to earn a bachelor's in elementary education from Utah State University and master's degrees

in school counseling and school administration and a doctorate in education leadership and policy from the University of Utah.

### General Consent Calendar

Board Member Cline asked to pull items 3, 4, 6, 7, and 8 from the consent calendar.

**MOTION** made by Member Cannon and seconded by Member Hart that the Board approves the consent calendar 1.1, 1.2, and 1.5 with items 1.3, 1.4, 1.6, 1.7, and 1.8 pulled from the consent calendar.

The **motion** passed unanimously.

1.1. **INFORMATION: Contracts/Agreements for Review**

1. Agreement Number: 171083IAA Amd. 7
2. Agreement Number: USBE180074MA Amd. 4
3. Agreement Number: USBE180075MA Amd. 2
4. Agreement Number: USBE190082MA Amd. 4
5. Agreement Number: USBE200074MA Amd. 2
6. Agreement Number: USBE230013CT

1.2. **ACTION: Contracts/Agreements for Approval**

1. Agreement Number: USBE230024IAA
2. Agreement Number: USBE230026MA
3. Agreement Number: PO3 400 2300000055

**MOTION** was made by that the Board approves the contracts/agreements presented.

The **motion** passed unanimously.

1.3. **ACTION: Co-sponsorship - Utah Digital Media Arts Festival (DMAF)**

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded by Member Hart that the Board accepts the Co-sponsorship for the 2023 Digital Media Arts Festival.

The **motion** passed unanimously.

1.4. ACTION: Bipartisan Safer Communities Act Stronger Connections Grant Program

**MOTION** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Moss that the Board forwards the grant program to a committee for review to prioritize the grant funding.

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boothe that the Board approves the funds' acceptance and directs staff to complete the Initial Submission of data under the Stronger Connections Grant Program.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Davis and seconded by Member Belnap to add "to the Board in the November board meeting."

**MOTION TO AMEND TO AMENDMENT** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Davis that the Board add "INCLUDING SCORING RUBRIC, AND PRIORITIZATION OF FUNDS."

**CALL THE QUESTION** made by Member Hutchings and seconded by Member Cannon.

The **call the question motion** carried with Member Cline opposed.

The **motion to amend the amendment** failed.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Belnap and seconded by Member Davis that the Board add "INCLUDING SCORING RUBRIC"

The **motion to amend** passed unanimously.

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION as amended** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boothe that the Board approves the funds' acceptance and directs staff

to complete the Initial Submission of data TO THE BOARD under the Stronger Connections Grant Program IN NOVEMBER. add "INCLUDING SCORING RUBRIC"

The **substitute motion** carried with Members Cline, Earl, Hymas, and Moss opposed.

1.5. ACTION: Approval of Meeting Minutes

**MOTION** that the Board approves the minutes, as presented.

The **motion** passed unanimously.

1.6. ACTION: 2022-2023 Elevate Program School Identification

**MOTION** was made by Member Cannon and seconded by Member Belnap that the Board approves recommendations for the Elevate School designation for the 2022-2023 Elevate School Cohort.

The **motion** carried with Member Cline opposed.

1.7. ACTION: Child Nutrition Program Grant

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Strate that the Board approves the Child Nutrition Program (CNP) to apply for the "Farm to School Grant" operated by the United States Department of Agriculture and Food (USDA).

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Hymas to strike the full-time position language from the grant program that provides funding from the "Farm to School Grant" operated by the USDA.

The **motion to amend** failed with Members Cline, Earl, Hymas and Moss opposed.

The **final motion** carried with Members Moss, Earl, and Cline opposed.

1.8. ACTION: Project AWARE Application Letter of Support

**MOTION** was made by Member Cannon and seconded by Member Lear that the Board approves the Letter of Commitment for the 2022 AWARE Federal Grant.

The **motion** carried with Members Hymas, Hart, Cline, and Earl opposed.

### Monthly Budget Report

#### Utah Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) State Plan Revision

The current Utah State Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) State Plan was originally approved by the U.S. Department of Education on July 11, 2018. You can find a copy of the approved plan here: <https://www2.ed.gov/admins/lead/account/stateplan17/map/ut.html>

Darin Nielsen, Assistant Superintendent of Student Learning and Leah Voorhies, Assistant Superintendent of Student Support spoke about the alignment with the approval of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (ESEA) COVID-19 State Plan Addendum for Utah in 2021-2022, the Utah State Board of Education has worked with stakeholders to revise the existing plan. These revisions reflect updating the language to reflect our current practice in alignment with state and Board direction.

USBE staff shared the draft and communicated the intent to seek public comment on the draft language ahead of the November 2022 Board Meeting where the Board will consider this revised plan for approval and submission to the U.S. Department of Education.

#### Monthly Budget Report

Scott Jones, Deputy Superintendent of Operations, and Deborah Jacobson, Assistant Superintendent of Operations, presented the Board of education's monthly budget report. In accordance with the Money Management Act and the Budgetary Procedures Act, the Utah State Board of Education is provided a report on the status of funds for their internal budgets.

#### Discretionary Funds Report

Deputy Superintendent Jones provided Information on the Discretionary Fund. The Utah State Board of Education maintains a Discretionary Funds account. In accordance with the



Money Management Act and the Budgetary Procedures Act the Utah State Board of Education is provided as status of the funds.

Chair Huntsman passed the gavel to Vice-chair Belnap.

### [SHARP Survey](#)

#### SHARP Survey Recommendations

During the June 2022 Board meeting of the Utah State Board of Education (USBE), the Board was provided with an overview of the SHARP survey. The survey contains questions designed to gather information about risk and protective factors within four areas of a child's life--community, family, school, and peer domains. The survey also had questions related to alcohol, tobacco, marijuana, and other drug use, to assist the Division of Substance Abuse and Mental Health, Department of Health, and State Board of Education in prevention efforts.

At the time of the June board meeting, the Board requested that USBE staff put together a workgroup and report back to the Board at the October meeting.

The Utah State Board of Education Prevention Specialist Tanya Albornoz, Policy Advisor Jeffrey Van Hulten, and Deputy Superintendent of Student Achievement Patty Norman provided an overview of the SHARP Survey and recommendations from the workgroup.

**MOTION** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board postpones issuing a Letter of Support until the length, content, age appropriateness of the survey, and roles are addressed.

**MOTION TO AMEND** made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Strate that the Board adds the following "And, the Board issues a Letter of Information in place of a Letter of Support. Furthermore, the Board, USBD staff, and partners at DHHS work to implement the recommendations produced by the workgroup for the 2023 distributions were possible, the 2025 distributions, and all future distributions."

**CALL THE QUESTION** made by Member Hutchings and seconded.

**Call the question** failed with Members Cannon, Davis, Huntsman, Hutchings, Lear, and Norton in favor, and with Members Boothe, Cline, Earl, Hansen, Hart, Hymas, Moss, and Strate opposed.

**MOTION TO AMEND THE AMENDMENT** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Lear to strike the words “~~work to~~” and “~~produced by the workgroup~~” then add the words “Implement the Board’s recommendations.”

Motion to amend the amendment passed unanimously.

#### **MOTION TO AMEND, AS AMENDED**

And, the Board issues a Letter of Information ~~in place of a Letter of Support~~. Furthermore, the Board, USBD staff, and partners at DHHS implement the Board’s recommendations for the 2023 distributions were possible, the 2025 distributions, and all future distributions.”

**Motion to amend, as amended** passed unanimously.

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION** was made by Member Davis and seconded by Member Norton that the board postpones deciding to issue a letter of support and issue a letter of information in the interim until the Board, USBD staff, and partners at DHHS implement the Board’s future recommendations to the extent the survey still maintains its validity.

**MOTION TO POSTPONE** was made by Member Huntsman and seconded by Member Hart.

The **motion to postpone** carried with Members Belnap, Cannon, Cline, Hart, Huntsman, Hymas, Moss, and Norton in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hansen, Hutchings, Lear, and Strate opposed.

**MOTION** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Huntsman that the Board place the SHARP survey letter of information in the October 7, 2022, Standards and Assessment Committee and receive the workgroup’s recommendations.

The **motion** passed unanimously.

## [2023 General Session Legislation Preparation](#)

### Requests for Statutory Changes

Angie Stallings, Deputy Superintendent of Policy, Jeff Van Hulten, Policy Advisor, and Greg Connell, Program Analyst lead a discussion on proposed policy/statutory requests and recommendations for the 2023 Legislative Session.

**MOTION** was made by Member Huntsman and seconded by Member Norton that the Board directs staff to work with legislators on potential amendments to Utah Code as proposed.

The **motion** carried with Member Cline opposed.

## [Standards Review Process](#)

### Proposed Standards Revision Process

The purpose of this item is to have board members provide feedback to the Standards Revision Process Draft 1 document for the Standards and Assessment to consider during their agenda item: Standards Revision Process on October 8, 2022. Staff will show potential revisions and receive preliminary guidance to proceed.

As described in 53E-4-202, the Utah State Board of Education shall establish the core standards for Utah public schools that:

- Identify the basic knowledge, skills, and competencies each student is expected to acquire or master as the student advances through the public education system.
- Increase in depth and complexity from year to year and focus on consistent and continual progress within and between grade levels and courses.

In order to achieve this purpose, the Utah State Board of Education has continued to refine the standards revision process to more effectively engage in the revision of standards upon their cueing cycle. Through the use of the current standards revision process, it has become apparent that additional changes to the process are desired. The staff has developed a draft of a revised process that will be in the October 8th Standards and Assessment Committee for consideration, review and refinement. Before committee, staff would like to hear from the

full Board on their input on the revised process to facilitate the refinements to be considered in committee.

### Finance Committee Report/Recommendations

Chair Jim Moss reported on the following items from the September 8, 2022, meeting. [Information on items not reported will be included in the exhibits to the Board meeting minutes.]

#### R277-419, Pupil Accounting (Amendment)

**MOTION** from the Committee that the Board approves R277-419, Pupil Accounting, Draft 2, on second and final reading.

The **motion** carried with Members Belnap, and Cline opposed.

#### State Fiscal Year 2023 Indirect Cost Pool (ICP) Status and Way Ahead

**MOTION** from the Committee that the Board directs staff to agree to the negotiated rates proposed by the Department of Education Finance Committee - 3 - September 9, 2022 and seek resolution of the positions being removed during negotiations for the State Fiscal Year 2024 rates. The Committee further recommends that the Board approve using \$500,000 of one-time funds from the unencumbered carry forward balances to cover the costs of the Deputy Superintendent of Student Achievement and the Administrative Assistant positions.

The **motion** passed unanimously.

#### State Fiscal Year 2022 Carry Forward Balance Status and Approval for Use

**MOTION** from the Committee that the Board approves the spending plans for the unencumbered state fiscal year 2022 carry forward balances.

The **motion** carried with Member Cline opposed.

#### R277-919, Education Regulatory Sandbox (Amendment)

**MOTION** from the Committee that the Board approves R277-919, Education Regulatory Sandbox, Draft 3, on the second and final reading.

The **motion** carried with Member Cline opposed.

### Law and Licensing Committee Report/Recommendations

Committee Chair Carol Lear reported on the following items from the September 8, 2022, meeting. [Information on items not reported will be included in the exhibits to the Board meeting minutes.]

#### R277-925, Effective Teachers in High Poverty Schools Incentive Program (Amendment)

**MOTION** from the Committee that the Board approves R277-925, Effective Teachers in High Poverty Schools Incentive Program, Draft 1 on the second and final reading.

The **motion** passed unanimously.

#### R277-911, Secondary Career and Technical Education (Repeal and Reenact)

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approves R277-911, Secondary Career and Technical Education, Draft 3, on the second and final reading.

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Cannon to approve Draft 4, as amended on the second and final reading, striking lines 589-598.

The **motion** carried with Members Cline opposed.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Huntsman to amend line 599 and change “restricted” to “unrestricted.”

The **motion to amend** passed unanimously.

The **final motion** carried with Member Cline.

Vice-Chair Belnap passed the gavel to Chair Huntsman.

### Standards and Assessment Committee Report/Recommendations

Committee Chair Scott Hansen reported on the following items from the September 8, 2022, meeting. [Information on items not reported will be included in the exhibits to the Board

meeting minutes.]

R277-630 Child Sex Abuse and Human Trafficking Prevention Training and Instruction(New Rule)

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approves R277-630, Child Sex Abuse and Human Trafficking Prevention Training and Instruction, Draft 3, on second and final reading.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board add language to line 79: (8) A board member may request additional review of the curriculum content by submitting the name of the person conducting the review and a signed non-disclosure agreement.

The **motion to amend** failed with Members Cline, Davis, Earl, Hutchings, Hymas, and Moss in favor, and Members Boothe, Cannon, Hansen, Lear, Norton, and Hart opposed and Members Belnap and Strate absent.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Earl that the Board add language to line 32: “or train school staff, educators, or administrators on topics prohibited by R277-328.”

The **motion** carried with Member Hansen opposed.

The **final motion** carried with Member Cline opposed.

Definitions: Educational Equity, R277-328

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board

- Remove the term “Common Humanity” from the definition list.
- Remove the term “Conflict Resolution” from the definition list.
- Approve the term “Good Character” and define it as [exemplifying time established principles or standards of worth such as: honesty, integrity, morality, civility, duty, honor, service, and obedience to law (53G-10-204)] to the definition list.
- Remove the terms “Hope” and “Opportunity” from the definition list.
- Remove the terms “Optimism”, “Personal Responsibility”, “Understanding”, “Unique potential”, and “Unity” from the definition list.

The **motion** carried with Members Cline, Earl, and Moss opposed.

**Executive Session**

**MOTION** was made by Member Cannon and seconded by Member Strate that the Board go into executive session for the purpose of discussing the character, professional competence, or physical or mental health of individuals and pending or reasonably imminent litigation.

Upon voice vote of all Members present, the Board went into closed session at 4:51 p.m.

Those present included the Members above and Sydnee Dickson, Patty Norman, Cybil Child, Kelsey James, and Bryan Quesenberry.

**MOTION** was made by Member Boothe and seconded by Member Cannon that the Board comes out of executive session.

**Motion** carried. The Board reconvened in an open meeting at 7:07 p.m.

**Executive Session Action Items****Educator Licenses**

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Cannon that the Board accepts the UPPAC Consent Calendar.

**Motion** passed unanimously.

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Cannon that the Board accepts the UPPAC recommendation in the following cases:

- Case No. 19-1589 – motion passed unanimously.
- Case No. 21-1830 – motion passed unanimously.
- Case No. 21-1852 – motion carried with Member Belnap opposed.
- Case No. 21-1859 voluntary surrender of license – motion passed unanimously.
- Case No. 22-1905 voluntary surrender of license – motion passed unanimously.

**Committee Appointments**

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Cannon that the Board appoints the following individuals to the Advisory Committee on Equity of Educational

### Services for Students (ACEESS)

- Tiffany Cisco, representing the American Indians, for a two-year term.
- Matt Okabe, representing Asian Americans, for a two-year term.
- Sarah Baird, representing Asian Americans, for a two-year term.
- Karilyn Frazier, representing the African Americans, for a two-year term.

**Motion** carried with Member Cline opposed.

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Cannon that the Board appoints the following individuals to the Student Advisory Committee (SAC) for one two-year term:

- District 2 Madison Coombs
- District 3 Xander McBride
- District 4 Rilee Endito
- District 6 Hannah Zoulek
- District 8 Thomas Pepper
- District 12 Dallin Ivie
- District 13 Sadie Clegg
- District 14 Zoe Olsen

The **motion** passed unanimously.

### Litigation

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Cannon that the Board approves the corrective action recommendation of the Audit Committee for the MSP Review.

The **motion** carried with Member Hymas abstained.

### **Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 7:27 p.m.

Cybil Child, Executive Assistant  
Minutes approved November 3, 2022