

**UTAH STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION
MEETING MINUTES**

October 8-9, 2015

STUDY SESSION - Thursday, October 8, 2015

A study session of the Utah State Board of Education was held October 8, 2015 at the Utah State Office of Education, 250 East 500 South, Salt Lake City, Utah. Chair David Crandall conducted.

Board members present included Chair David Crandall, First Vice Chair David Thomas, Second Vice Chair Jennifer Johnson, and Members Dixie Allen, Laura Belnap, Leslie Castle, Barbara Corry, Brittney Cummins, Linda Hansen, Mark Huntsman, Stan Lockhart, Spencer Stokes, and Terryl Warner.

Others present included Brad Smith, Rich Nye, Sydnee Dickson, Angela Stallings, Scott Jones, Travis Rawlings—Utah State Office of Education; Lorraine Austin, Emilie Wheeler, Debbie Davis—Utah State Board of Education; Jan Ferré, LCPD; Jay Blain, Utah Education Association; Freddie Cooper, Coalition of Minorities Advisory Committee.

Chair David Crandall called the meeting to order at 3:13 p.m.

Student Growth Measures

Associate Superintendent Rich Nye introduced Dr. Scott Marion from the Centers for Assessment. Dr. Marion gave a presentation on student growth measures.

Educator Licensing

Travis Rawlings, USOE Director of Educator Licensing, gave a presentation on educator licensing and the various avenues through which educators can become licensed.

Member Lockhart questioned whether licensing is needed at all, given the focus on data driven outcomes. Mr. Rawlings responded that licensing has to do with the public trust, and ensures a minimum level of competence. Member Castle added that regulating licensing on the front end is a good idea for the safety of students. Mr. Rawlings explained that there is

balance between public trust and flexibility. As a regulatory agency, the USOE is trying to ensure best practices in the majority of cases, but there is also trust for district superintendents and schools principals, and that is why other avenues exist. Superintendent Smith reported that he has challenged staff to ask if the system currently in place is serving the state well, or if a different regulatory modality would serve it better. Member Castle questioned whether teacher training programs are preparing future teachers for today's classroom. Vice Chair Johnson noted that the teaching profession is unique in that there are compulsory clients that are minors. She questioned whether the safety of students should be separated from the delivery of a service.

Chair Crandall reminded the Board that licensing is a responsibility of the Board. He asked Mr. Rawlings to provide an overview of the competency requirements for teaching and how teachers might lose their licenses because of a lack of competency.

Adjournment

The study session adjourned at 5:12 p.m.

Following the study session, the Board reconvened as the Governing Board for the Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind. Minutes of that meeting are under separate cover.

Following the USDB Board meeting, the Finance, Law and Licensing, and Standards and Assessment Committees met.

UTAH STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING - October 9, 2015

A regular meeting of the Utah State Board of Education was held October 9, 2015 at the Utah State Office of Education, 250 East 500 South, Salt Lake City, Utah. Chair David Crandall conducted. The meeting commenced at 8:03 a.m.

Board Members Present:

Chair David L. Crandall	Member Brittney Cummins
1 st Vice Chair David L. Thomas	Member Linda B. Hansen
2 nd Vice Chair Jennifer A. Johnson	Member Mark Huntsman
Member Dixie L. Allen	Member Stan Lockhart
Member Laura Belnap	Member Spencer F. Stokes
Member Leslie B. Castle	Member Terryl Warner
Member Barbara W. Corry	Member Joel Wright

Board Members Excused:

Member Jefferson Moss

Executive and Board Staff Present:

Brad Smith, State Superintendent	Darin Brush, USOR Executive Director
Sydnee Dickson, Deputy Superintendent	Lorraine Austin, Board Secretary
Scott Jones, Associate Supt.	Emilie Wheeler, Board Communications Specialist
Rich Nye, Associate Supt.	Debbie Davis, Internal Audit Director
Angela Stallings, Associate Supt.	Nicole Call, Assistant Attorney General
Joel Coleman, USDB Superintendent	

Others Present:

Blake Wigdahl, Thanksgiving Point; Lisa Nentl-Bloom, Jay Blain–Utah Education Association; Holly Godsey, University of Utah; Ashley Russon, Alpine School District; Karen Peterson, Governor’s Office; Kris Fawson, Utah Statewide Independent Living Centers; Joylin Lincoln; Jeff Mar, Common Sense Education; Charyl Lala; Ray Timothy, Utah Education and Telehealth Network; Terry Shoemaker, Wasatch School District; Barbara Gentry, Jane Harward–Jordan School District; Fawn Morgan, Gwen Knight–School Library Pals; David Sharette, APS

Opening Business

Chair David Crandall called the meeting to order at 8:03 a.m. Vice Chair Jennifer Johnson led those present in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Board Member Message

Member Brittany Cummins welcomed the Board. She shared a story about making sloppy joes for her family, and making them with hamburger when they didn't like the version with lentils. She realized when they didn't eat those sloppy joes either that she had asked the wrong question, as they just didn't like sloppy joes. She likened the story to the Board, acknowledging that as individuals Board members may not always ask the right question or interpret the data in the right way. However, as Board members come together they bring different perspectives and understandings, and the Board is more likely to get the outcomes it wants for students.

Introduction of New Employees

H.R. Director David Rodemack introduced new employees Stacy Carroll, Lindsey Adams, Emily Nordfelt, Peter Cho, Kenneth Nielsen, Natasha Baliff, Sheryl Garner, Jonathan Collins, Scott Roskelley, Michelle Hernandez, Kristi Bostic.

Acknowledgment of Student Artwork

Cathy Jensen, Fine Arts Specialist, informed the Board about the student art work in the Board room from Morningside Elementary, Cottonwood Elementary, and Oakwood Elementary.

Utah State Office of Rehabilitation (USOR)

Darin Brush, USOR Executive Director, gave a presentation about the Case Service Expenditure Model that is now in place. He informed the Board that USOR is to the point of serving not only clients that were already in a plan, but also opening up the Order of Selection waiting list to serve clients in the most significantly disabled category. They can begin moving clients off the wait list early next month.

Director Brush was acknowledged for his work to improve the USOR processes to the point that services will be provided to more people in need.

Public Comment

Lisa Cluff, Executive Director, Friends for Art Works for Kids - thanked the Board for its support of the program, which has grown significantly this year. Art Works for Kids is a very unique public-private partnership. There is research and information on how well it has done and what it offers to children. She showed a brief video clip with the program's founder, Beverley Taylor Sorenson, talking about bringing arts education into the elementary schools.

Jo Whitaker, Piute District Arts Specialist - indicated that without the Beverley Taylor Sorenson Arts Learning Program (BTSALP) the district would not be what it is. Through the program, students are learning about art and science. She suggested plugging the arts into STEM (science, technology, engineering, and math), and making it STEAM.

Shane Erickson, Superintendent, Piute School District - expressed his support for BTSALP and for the innovative instruction and engaged learning it fosters. Students that may not have been able to get math or reading are now achieving success in those subjects through the arts.

Patti Harrington, representing the Utah School Boards Association, Utah School Superintendents Association, and Utah Association of School Business Officials (USBA/USSA/UASBO) - thanked Board members for connecting with school districts. She referenced the USBA/USSA/UASBO budget request distributed to the Board. The budget request mirrors that of the Board in seeking enrollment growth and WPU increase, and funding for professional development, technology, and optional extended-day kindergarten. She expressed the need for funding for specific programs that have gone without enrollment increases. She also drew attention to the Teacher Shortage Report which was distributed.

Dr. Holly Godsey, University of Utah, Director of Teacher Development, Center for Science and Math Education, and member of the 7th Grade Science Standards writing team - pointed out that the 6-8 revised Science Standards are not about new content (although there is some new content), but provide a different perspective of teaching students to do science as opposed to just learning about science. The real power behind science is having the tools to investigate any question and getting reliable results no matter who is doing the study. The new standards will help students obtain those tools.

Ms. Godsey addressed criticisms of the standards from the Fordham Report. Although there were some good recommendations that the writing team took to heart, the writing team had a fundamental disagreement with the Fordham Report's premise that facts are more important than process. She indicated that basing the standards on the Next General Science Standards (NGSS) is based on best practices and research, and expressed that to ignore all of the work and research that went into producing the NGSS as a resource is irresponsible at best and very detrimental to the process of moving forward.

Ashley Russon, Alpine School District K-12 Science Specialist and member of the 8th grade science standards writing team - the revised standards are better standards that will help students become problem solvers and critical thinkers. These new standards will prepare students to be the innovators and creators.

Blake Wigdahl, Vice President of Design and Programming, Thanksgiving Point - expressed high support for the revised science standards. Thanksgiving Point focuses on the values and principles instilled in the new standards and provides support to elementary teachers and students. Approval of the standards is essential for the future. The standards have been written by teachers and parents and are truly innovative and within the nature of what Utah values.

Donald Feener, University of Utah Professor of Biology - for the past several years he has run a program that puts STEM graduates in K-12 schools as science mentors. He spoke in favor of the proposed science standards as they teach science in a way that is practiced by real scientists. He addressed the criticism about including climate change and evolution in the standards, and reported that in the science community those subjects are not the least bit controversial. Climate change and evolution are not irrelevant in children's lives and climate change will be the defining issue of our children's adulthood. They will need to know how it happened and what to do about it. Also, the ability to control potential epidemics all depend on our understanding from where diseases originate and change, and that is what the study of evolution allows.

Dale Clayton, University of Utah Professor of Biology - informed that he teaches evolutionary biology, and indicated within the scientific community it is not a controversial

sub-field of science. It is important to teach children what they need to know to continue on to higher education.

John Longina, University of Utah Professor of Biology - spoke in favor of the revised science standards. He has seen an explosion of research in recent years regarding climate change, and that is science at its best. He has an enormous respect for science and its ability to improve human lives. For students to join the STEM workforce and compete globally they must be prepared, including with climate change and evolution.

Patrice Corneli, University of Utah Professor of Biology - analyzes DNA sequences where she discovers evolutionary relationships among cone snails. These snails emit toxins, which have tremendous value as medications. Evolutionary analyses are critical to research because they facilitate the discovery of new medicines. She is troubled by a small contingent who misrepresent intelligent biology as a scientific alternative to evolutionary biology.

Lisa Nentl-Bloom, Executive Director, Utah Education Association - invited the Board to attend the UEA convention and Education Exposition on October 16-17. She expressed UEA's disappointment that the Board did not take action on cases from the Utah Professional Practices Advisory Commission last month, and expressed the importance of acting on these cases in a timely manner. She thanked the Board for its time and commitment to educators.

General Consent Calendar

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Thomas and seconded by Member Huntsman that the Board approve the General Consent Calendar.

Member Belnap asked for more clarity regarding items C, F, I, and J.

Item C, Contract Reports - it was noted that the contract with Evaluation and Training Institute adds to the data analysis for Imagine Learning. Imagine Learning made an error in the submission of its data and will cover the cost of the additional analysis needed. The contract amendment must be made in order for the USOE to invoice Imagine Learning for that work.

Item I, Request for Temporary Authorizations - Travis Rawlings explained that the educators listed are granted temporary licenses for one school year through letters of authorization. This type of license is the emergency credential that is limited to three per an

educator's career. They are state-given licenses.

Item J, List of Educator Licenses Processed - Travis Rawlings clarified that the international guest teachers that work in the dual immersion program are issued three-year licenses under a Memorandum of Understanding between the agency and the countries where the teachers are licensed. The agency sponsors them on a visa for those three years. If a local education agency wants to keep the teachers longer, they switch to an H1B visa, and must go through the foreign credential educator process.

Item F, R277-494 Charter School and Online Student Participation in Extracurricular or Co-curricular School Activities - Member Belnap questioned why the rule required the charter school to pay a \$75 participation fee for a student to participate in another school's activities. Patti Harrington, USSA Executive Director, explained that in traditional schools there is a general activity fee in addition to specific activity fees, and the \$75 covers that fee. Member Corry also explained that this was an effort to reimburse schools for costs that come with having additional students in the school beyond the activity itself. Member Belnap suggested that the student should pay the fee, not the school.

Associate Superintendent Angie Stallings suggested that if the Board decides to eliminate the \$75 fee, it might also consider the portion of this rule that requires the online or charter school to make the decision on whether a student may participate in another school. Member Cummins suggested doing some research prior to making any additional changes to the rule.

Motion to approve the Consent Calendar carried; Member Lockhart absent.

SAGE License Agreement

Superintendent Smith reviewed the opportunity for Utah to lease test items to a fourth state—Ohio. There are presently agreements in place with Arizona, Tennessee and Florida.

The contract has been under legal review and one substantive change is being recommended in Section 4.7. Under the prior contracts, American Institutes for Research (AIR) offset money Utah owed AIR, under the contract in place with AIR, against these new items. That provision will be removed from the Ohio contract. Payment for Ohio's leasing of the test

items will be passed along directly to the state of Utah and any payment owed by Utah to AIR for services rendered will be paid through the normal and ordinary invoice process, with no offset. With that change, Superintendent Smith recommended approval of the contract and stated his belief that it represents a wise and prudent use of taxpayer dollars in developing these items and offsetting some of the expense involved.

Member Wright asked how we know enough is being charged. Superintendent Smith responded that the question has been asked in each case and there have been back and forth negotiations. The price point is very near that of private organizations.

Member Allen questioned if Utah's contract with Florida will be affected if Florida opts out of computer adaptive testing. Superintendent indicated the contract would not be affected, and informed that the premise that Florida is opting out is not correct. The recent Florida validation study that went before the Florida state senate concluded that Florida has followed correct testing protocols that comported with best testing practices.

Vice Chair Thomas requested a copy of the contract between AIR and Ohio. Superintendent responded that it will be available and noted that the provision is also covered in the proposed novation.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Thomas and seconded by Member Lockhart that the Board approve the license agreement between the State of Utah and AIR with regard to licensing items to Ohio.

Vice Chair Johnson noted that although we are in the middle of attempting a novation of the AIR contract, approving this change ahead of the novation is a timely action that will be to the Board's advantage.

Chair Crandall noted that the parties listed in the contract are AIR and the State of Utah, and questioned whether it should be with the State Board of Education instead. Superintendent Smith referenced page 6, the signature page of the contract, and recollected that the formal owner of the copyrighted material is the State of Utah through the State Board of Education, which he believes is why the signature page (page 6) is drafted as it is. He asked the Board's attorney to check on whether that is correct.

Motion carried; Members Castle and Hansen absent.

Monthly Budget Report

Associate Superintendent Jones reviewed the report. He pointed out that more detail is being provided regarding the various units of the State Office of Education. He reported that the forensics of matching revenues with budgets is planned, and expressed confidence that the numbers will be very reliable by spring.

Mr. Jones reported that a new Director of Internal Accounting will start on October 13, and once she is in place, three managerial accountants will be hired.

Vice Chair Johnson thanked Associate Superintendent Jones, his team, and the financial staff in the sections for their patience throughout the process.

MOTION was made by Member Huntsman and seconded by Vice Chair Johnson that the Board approve the report.

Motion carried unanimously.

Digital Teaching and Learning Task Force Report

Vice Chair David Thomas, Chair of the Digital Teaching and Learning Task Force, referenced the proposed Master Plan—Essential Elements for Technology Powered Learning, and distributed statements of support for the plan. He introduced the consultants for the plan and staff present: Rick Gaisford, USOE; Tom Greaves, the Greaves Group; Jeff Mao and Steve Garton, Common Sense Education; Cheryl Lemke, the Metiri Group; Terry Shoemaker, Wasatch School District; and Ray Timothy, Utah Education and Telehealth Network (UETN).

The Digital Teaching and Learning Task Force was created in S.B. 222 in the 2015 Legislative Session. The legislation gave some direction to the Board to develop a funding plan and statewide master plan for technology. The legislation also tasked UETN with doing an inventory of the current state of technology in the schools.

A presentation on the plan was given by Jeff Mao, Cheryl Lemke, Tom Greaves, and Steve Garton. Superintendent Shoemaker gave the perspective of a local superintendent. He reported that his district has been engaged in the process of converting to digital in order to change teaching and learning. Technology by itself does not change teaching and learning—

professional development must be a part of it, along with working with vendors to change products. Dr. Ray Timothy expressed his support for the work of the task force, and expressed appreciation for the clear delineation of roles for the Board and UETN. He supports the final outcome of the project.

Vice Chair Thomas explained that adoption of the master plan is the first step; the second step is the qualifying grant program that will have to be implemented through Board rule and funded in the next legislative session.

Vice Chair Johnson asked whether there will be technical support during the application process for the qualifying grant program. Mr. Mao responded that the application is not designed to weed out entities, but to determine at what point they are at. Technical assistance will be provided moving forward. Vice Chair Thomas identified that there are issues in term of the cost, and coaches will need to be employed to assist local education agencies (LEAs) through the process and remain with the LEAs to ensure proper implementation. It was clarified that technical assistance would be provided both by the USOE and UETN depending on the needs of the LEA. Flexibility is key.

Member Cummins asked Superintendent Shoemaker how this program would have been helpful to him as he developed technology systems in his district. Superintendent Shoemaker responded that the district made some mistakes as they moved forward, and bought technology without paying attention to professional development. They learned from looking at schools throughout the country. It would have been immensely helpful to have this plan in place and will help in reaching out nationally to improve processes.

Member Huntsman emphasized that the moving forward the roles for UETN and the USOE must be well defined so they aren't at cross purposes. Vice Chair Thomas reported that the Task Force spent a great deal of time defining governance and it will be very clear. Each section of the plan contains a specific section on the state's duties and the LEAs' duties.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Thomas and seconded by Vice Chair Johnson that the Board approve Utah's Master Plan—Essential Elements for Technology Powered Learning.

Motion carried unanimously.

The Board applauded the Task Force members and acknowledged Vice Chair Thomas

for his chairmanship of the Task Force and his work on technology over many years.

Grades 6-8 Science with Engineering Education (SEEd) Standards

Deputy Superintendent Dickson discussed the Board's process in developing standards in general since 1984. She expressed appreciation for this Board's deep interest in having a transparent and thorough process that brings the right people to the table.

USOE Science Specialist Rickie Scott referenced the document, Utah Science with Engineering Education (UT SEEd) Standards Release for 30-day Review. He pointed out that a crosswalk has been created comparing the current standards with the revised version, and a cost and budget analysis for implementation of the standards has been developed. He clarified that the funding identified in the cost analysis is not additional money, but has already been allotted for this purpose. The funding for test item development is also in place. He reported that one of the concerns from LEAs is regarding new textbooks, and informed that the USOE has been developing open textbooks for the last four years and textbooks will be in place before the standards are implemented.

Mr. Scott reviewed how the updated proposed standards address concerns that have been expressed. The changes: 1) added clarity; 2) made shifts in content and sequence of standards; 3) shifted wording so standards are based on science reasoning, not on political motivations; and 4) addressed age appropriateness.

Vice Chair Thomas stated that science is about exploration and constantly asking questions, and the essence of the scientific method is caught up in a search for truth. He informed the Board that he learned the scientific method from his father, an evolutionary biologist who was critical of science and scientists who did not use facts to inform them. Vice Chair Thomas expressed that Utah's standards should require the use of scientific method and that the Next General Science Standards seem to be more about politics and less about scientific method.

He voiced a concern about Standard 7.5.4 under the 7th grade standards and the use of "Analyze displays of pictorial data to compare patterns in the embryological development . . ." He explained that analysis of pictorial data comes from a theory called the biogenetic law by

Ernest Heckel, which has been disproved by science. He suggested the wording be changed to remove “displays of pictorial data” so any implications about Heckel’s pictorials are removed.

Member Warner asked whether the online textbook that teachers have worked on will be updated. Mr. Scott reported that it will. Member Warner reported that the science teachers with which she has spoken overwhelmingly gave the message that professional development is needed. Mr. Scott responded that a plan is in place for professional development. Assuming the Board approves the standards in December, a pilot year will go into place in 2017-18, which will allow time for professional development and textbook development.

Vice Chair Johnson asked whether resources will be targeted specifically for 6th grade teachers who may not have the same background as someone with a science endorsement. Mr. Scott responded that specific professional development will be given for each grade.

At the request of Member Stokes, Mr. Scott reviewed the timeline for the standards thus far. Member Stokes stated his feeling that the standards have been reviewed and scrubbed and are ready to go.

Vice Chair Johnson questioned why the use of the pictorial data pointed out by Vice Chair Thomas was used. Mr. Scott responded that he wasn’t aware of the reason, but didn’t feel the writing team would be uncomfortable with the change.

Member Castle observed that the Board put a process in place and that process has been followed, but is now being changed at the last moment. She questioned at what point the standards will begin to degrade if the process keeps going.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Cummins that the Board approve releasing the Utah Science with Engineering Education (UT SEEd) Standards, as presented, for 30-day public comment.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Vice Chair Thomas and seconded by Vice Chair Johnson that the wording, “displays of pictorial data,” be removed from Section 7.5.4 and that the sentence read, “Analyze data to compare patterns in the embryological development across multiple species to identify similarities and differences not evident in the fully formed anatomy.”

Member Castle suggested passing both the amendment and the standards today, rather than waiting another 30 days for other concerns to slow down the process.

Motion to amend carried unanimously.

Vice Chair Johnson noted that in the last Board meeting the expectation of 30 days for additional public comment was given. Member Cummins concurred and suggested that by not releasing the standards now, the perception could be that the Board is hiding something. She expressed her support for the standards and for the work of the writing team and USOE staff. It was clarified that this version of the standards has not been made public.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Belnap and seconded by Member Corry that the Board release the standards for 20 days and bring them back for final approval in the November Board meeting.

Member Cummins questioned the necessity of the change as it won't make a difference in long-term implementation.

Member Castle asked what the legitimate fallout would be if the Board passes the standards today. She stated her feeling that the Board is sinking its own process.

Member Lockhart noted that the public has not seen the standards since the last revision and stated his feeling that passing them with the public having the opportunity to review the final document doesn't make sense.

Vice Chair Johnson called the question on the amendment. Without objection, the vote was taken.

Motion to amend failed, with Members Allen, Belnap, Castle, Corry, Hansen and Stokes in favor, and Members Cummins, Crandall, Huntsman, Johnson, Lockhart, Thomas, Warner and Wright opposed.

Motion to release for 30-day comment carried, with Members Allen, Belnap, Corry, Cummins, Crandall, Huntsman, Johnson, Lockhart, Stokes, Warner and Wright in favor, and Members Castle, Hansen, and Thomas opposed.

Utah State Board of Education Strategic Plan

Superintendent Smith distributed and reviewed an updated draft of the Board's Strategic Plan. He expressed appreciation to Dr. Dickson who created the outline.

Vice Chair Thomas pointed out that on the first page in the Educational Equity box the sentence isn't clear. He also asked for more information to be added on recruiting and retaining educators. Superintendent Smith mentioned that some areas have had more discussion than others. Vice Chair Thomas questioned whether it is an expectation that all the below the line programs will be included. Superintendent Smith responded that his preference would be for the Board to identify particular items that have more impact than others.

Member Lockhart noted that there is nothing in the plan about college and career readiness. He also felt that rather than identifying the funding priorities and then embedding them into the plan, intentional discussions are needed first on what the ideal profile of a high school graduate should be, and how best to achieve that. Superintendent Smith concurred that those discussions are needed, and reported that it will begin with a discussion on college and career readiness as part of the Board study session in November. It will be an iterative process, and the Board will need to set aside time to have those discussions.

Vice Chair Johnson suggested that the word "student" rather than "scholar" be used throughout. She also suggested that the last sentence under the Purpose read, ". . . we commit to achieve these ends." She asked that as the document is refined, dollar values be added along with responsibilities for implementation.

Vice Chair Thomas suggested the following changes:

- Page 2, add item G - College and Career Readiness, including action concerning high quality standards and using SAGE testing to evaluate whether students are learning those standards.
- Page 3, G-1a - the theory of action needs to include the impending teacher shortage.
- Page 3, G-1c - add a placeholder on merit or performance pay. Superintendent Smith suggested that a review of the teacher retirement system may also be worthwhile.

- Page 3, G-1d - add a discussion of accrediting university teacher preparation programs.
- Page 4 - correct the spelling of oversight.

Member Wright expressed that he senses a lack of humility to some extent in the document. He suggested acknowledging that most of the progress will come from dedicated teachers, parents and students with the hope that they will ask the Board to remove obstacles so the education system can be improved. Superintendent Smith suggested the idea of partnerships would best be captured as part of implementation. Member Wright recommended that a separate section be developed, because of its importance.

Member Stokes recommended that acronyms and references to things with which the general public is not familiar be removed or reworded.

Superintendent Smith noted that the Board's Communication Plan will be added to the Engagement section.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Lockhart that the plan be referred to a committee of the Board for further development.

Motion carried unanimously. Board leadership will assign it to a committee.

SFY 2017 Legislative Priorities

Associate Superintendent Scott Jones referenced the budget priorities document revised since the last Board meeting. He reported that his staff is in the process of putting together the Board's increased funding requests for the governor and legislature. It is an evolving process. Staff are also gathering data to determine amounts for the WPU increase and growth, so the amounts listed under those categories are subject to change. He clarified that historically the amount for WPU has included special education and CTE add-ons; the request for additional special education funding listed as #5 is in addition to the WPU increase. He also noted that a request to add funding for the Carson Smith Scholarship program has been made.

Mr. Scott reported that the Governor's Office of Management and Budget (GOMB) has invited the Board to submit its increased funding requests for the WPU and growth; in

addition, they invited a request for a system within the USOE for \$600,000 to \$1 million to better engineer reports and budget controls. The USDB steps and lanes adjustment request was also invited.

Vice Chair Johnson asked Ben Leishman from the Legislative Fiscal Analyst's Office for a description of why there is a divergence in the Special Education and CTE add-on amounts and why they are linked. Mr. Leishman explained that the concept of two WPU values goes back to the 2011 Legislative Session. In an effort to try and simplify the Minimum School Program the legislature eliminated several non-WPU-funded (below the line) programs, taking the money associated with those programs and increasing the WPU value. The programs that were really impacted were social security and retirement, which was a block grant that helped school districts pay those costs, and it had also been the program that was used to deliver many of the cuts during the downturn. The money was taken from the largely unrestricted programs below the line and put it into the WPU value. When that was done, the WPU value increased for all WPU programs. Some of that unrestricted money would have gone into two restricted programs, namely Special Education and Career and Technical Education. School districts complained about the restriction, and in response, two WPU values were implemented to include the add-on programs. The add-ons are valued slightly less than every other WPU.

Member Stokes asked for the timeline for submission of the Board's requests to the legislature. Associate Superintendent Jones replied that it is an evolving process that begins with his submitting the Board request to GOMB. Mr. Leishman responded that changes can be made any time during the legislative session. Member Stokes commented that the Board has a great internal process, but doesn't have a process in place for receiving requests from external groups.

MOTION was made by Member Stokes and seconded by Member Wright that a form be developed and made accessible for outside groups to submit budget requests to the Board, and that the requests be included on the November agenda.

Member Stokes suggested that key elements on the form should include what the program is, the amount and type of funds being requested, and why it should be a priority.

Vice Chair Johnson commented that the process is needed, but it seems late this year to

receive external requests. Member Stokes responded that this would be a way for the Board to give its seal of approval for programs that fit into its education strategy. Member Huntsman also expressed concern, feeling that a protocol needs to be in place and the next Board meeting is too soon. He suggested that something more than a form may be needed.

Motion carried unanimously.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Stokes that the Board request legislation to change references in statute from the “Utah State Office Education” to the “Utah State Board of Education.”

Motion carried unanimously.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Lockhart that the Board request legislation to replace references in statute from “school district” to “local education agency” where appropriate.

Motion carried unanimously.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Vice Chair Thomas that the Board add a one-time funding request to the USDB priorities list for \$1 million to purchase the Grant Elementary School building.

Motion carried unanimously.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Hansen that the Board add \$175,000 to the USOR ongoing list for funding credits for an Assistant Attorney General for USOR.

Motion carried unanimously.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Lockhart that the Board recommend to the legislature elimination of the Electronic High School (EHS).

Vice Chair Johnson indicated that there are now many entities that provide similar services as the EHS, so the Board is essentially running a high school that competes with other high schools.

Member Cummins expressed that she would like more background information as this hasn't been previously discussed. Member Allen also reported that she believes rural districts are using EHS for home school students and would like more information on how the school is

being used before voting on it.

Deputy Superintendent Dickson reported that the unique feature of the EHS is its open-entry, open-exit system by which students can take courses. When it was started years ago it was very innovative; it has evolved from a full offering of courses and full staff to a pared down offering, but still serving thousands of students with credits. She suggested determining whether these offerings can be obtained from existing virtual schools and whether there is still the need for an open-entry, open-exit program.

MOTION TO POSTPONE was made by Vice Chair Johnson in order for data to be gathered.

Without objection, the motion was postponed.

Audit Committee Report

SFY 2016 Internal Audit Plan

Committee Chair David Thomas reminded the Board that it approved the FY 16 Internal Audit Plan in its last meeting. The Audit Committee is recommending changes in the plan to combine some of the audits, add an audit on Educator Salary Adjustments, and change the dates and designations of the types of audits.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve the amended Internal Audit Plan. Motion carried unanimously.

Standing Committee Reports

LAW AND LICENSING COMMITTEE

Committee Chair Leslie Castle reported on the following items from the Committee.

Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes

The Committee approved the September 17, 2015 minutes.

Esperanza Elementary Charter Amendment Request

The Committee discussed the recommendation from the State Charter School Board (SCSB) for approval of Esperanza Elementary's request for an increase in student enrollment. After the SCSB made the recommendation, Esperanza was designated as a low performing school under the School Turnaround Program.

MOTION from Committee that the Board ask the State Charter School Board to reconsider its recommendation for a change to Esperanza's charter due to its designation as a low-performing school.

Motion carried; Member Stokes absent.

Karl G. Maeser Preparatory Academy Charter Amendment

Motion from Committee that the Board approve the amendment to the charter of Karl G. Maeser Preparatory Academy to add 20 students.

Motion carried; Member Wright abstained; Member Stokes absent.

R277-207 Utah Professional Practices Advisory Commission (UPPAC), Disciplinary Guidelines

The Committee reviewed proposed amendments to R277-207 and made additional changes. An updated rule with the committee changes was distributed to the Board.

The committee discussed the need for a thorough review of all the UPPAC rules, and determined to meet separately for such a review.

The Committee approved R277-207, as amended, on second reading.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve R277-207 *Utah Professional Practices Advisory Commission (UPPAC), Disciplinary Guidelines*, as amended, on third and final reading.

Member Castle explained that she did not vote in favor of the rule in committee because she met with the Division of Occupational and Professional Licensing (DOPL) and was surprised to learn that there are many guidelines in DOPL that have much higher standards and presumptions that are more strident for licensing than are in place for licensing teachers. DOPL issues every other license in the state. Much more discussion is needed.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member

Stokes that wording be appended to line 147, Section 2(9)c, to read, “and demonstrates a reasonable expectation that the educator will not repeat the misconduct.”

Motion to amend carried unanimously.

Vice Chair Johnson suggested adding a presumption for what happens if an administrator is not reporting misconduct. Superintendent Smith recommended that it be added to the educator ethics rule rather than this rule.

Motion carried unanimously.

R277-726 Statewide Online Education Program

The Committee postponed discussion of this rule.

R277-705 Secondary School Completion Diplomas

The Committee reviewed amendments to R277-705 to make the rule consistent with accreditation language in R277-410. The Committee approved R277-705, as amended, on first reading.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve R277-705 *Secondary School Completion Diplomas*, as amended, on second reading.

Motion carried unanimously.

R277-118 LEA Post-employment Benefits Plan

The Committee reviewed and discussed the repeal of R277-118 due to the passage of H.B. 208 *School District Post-employment Health Insurance Benefits* in the 2015 Legislative Session. The Committee approved repeal of the rule on first reading.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve repeal of R277-118 *Post-employment Benefits Plan* on second reading.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Vice Chair Johnson that the Board suspend its rules and approve repeal of R277-118 on third and final reading. Without objection the motion was amended.

Motion to repeal on third and final reading carried unanimously.

American Preparatory Academy (APA)–Salem Request for
Charter Termination and Satellite School

During the 2015 Legislative Session, S.B. 227 *Charter School Revisions* passed (53A-1a-509.5). The statute allows charter school governing boards to request participation in the voluntary charter school improvement process by providing notice and holding a hearing for parents and guardians of students enrolled in the charter school regarding the governing board's intent to make a request. APA-Salem held such a hearing and approached the State Charter School Board about entering into a separate agreement to pursue the improvement process. APA-Salem brought a proposal to the SCSB for consideration, including: 1) terminating the charter for APA-Salem; 2) granting a satellite school to Utah Charter Academies (UCA); and 3) the process for transfer of assets and liabilities. The SCSB approved the proposal and forwarded the recommendation to the Board.

MOTION from Committee that the Board deny the SCSB request, without prejudice, because the statutory requirements have not been met.

Motion carried; Member Wright abstained.

The Committee directed staff to create a protocol and/or rule consistent with 53A-1a-509.5.

STANDARDS AND ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE

Committee Chair Laura Belnap reported on the following items from the Committee.

Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes

The minutes of the September 17, 2015 meeting were amended to indicate that the Secondary Math Standards are being released for the writing committee to begin the writing process.

The Committee approved the minutes as amended.

Formula for Calculating a Growth Target - R277-497 *School Grading System*

The Committee reviewed and discussed various models for the structure of a student

growth formula. The Committee directed staff to make changes to R277-497 and bring the rule to the committee in November along with case studies that compare the decile approach with the student growth percentile of forty.

Vice Chair Johnson asked for a case study on the adequate growth percentile (AGP) as well. Associate Superintendent Rich Nye informed that the AGP works well with the lower grades, but not as well in the higher grades. It is a more robust measure when there are multiple years of the same test administration. He reported that the USOE has begun supplying AGP data to local education agencies. He indicated he will provide a report to the Board.

R277-404 Requirements for Assessment of Student Achievement

Parental Exclusion from State Assessment Form

Rule R277-404 was passed on second reading in the Board's September 17, 2015 meeting. Since that time, additional amendments needed were identified. The Committee reviewed the proposed amendments and made additional amendments. An updated rule was distributed to the Board.

The Committee also reviewed an amendment to the Parental Exclusion from State Assessment Form. It was noted that the required civics test is on the form, even though if students do not take it they cannot graduate.

The Committee approved R277-404, as amended, on second reading.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve R277-404 *Requirements for Assessment of Student Achievement*, as amended, on third and final reading.

Motion carried unanimously.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve the Parental Exclusion from State Assessments Form, as amended.

Member Allen reported that some schools are apprehensive about including the civics test on the form. Member Belnap responded that it must be included as directed in statute. Associate Superintendent Stallings noted that there are two conflicting statutes: by statute if student have to be given the opportunity to opt out of state-required tests; also by statute, if

students don't take the civics exam, they cannot graduate. Member Lockhart questioned what would happen if students are allowed to opt out of the civics exam and still be allowed to graduate. Ms. Stallings suggested that as the more specific law is the one on the civics exam, it would probably take precedence.

Vice Chair Thomas indicated that the sponsor of the legislation is open to looking at changes needed so that the law makes sense.

Motion carried unanimously.

Fine Arts Standards

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve the release of the draft Fine Arts Standards for 90-day public review.

Motion carried unanimously.

K-12 Physical Education Standards

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve the release of the draft K-12 Physical Education Standards for 90-day public review.

Motion carried unanimously.

General Financial Literacy Standards and Objectives

The Committee reviewed and discussed the updated standards. Two new standards have been added to Strand 1, and it was recommended that since this is a substantial change to the standards, the process for releasing the standards for public comment be followed.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve release of the draft General Financial Literacy Standards and Objectives for 20-day public review.

Motion carried unanimously.

Child Sexual Abuse Prevention Instructional Materials

The Committee received information regarding the potential providers for child sexual abuse prevention instructional material. Statute requires the Board, in partnership with the

Department of Human Services, to approve the material.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve the list of potential providers presented.

Several Board members indicated they would like more time to review the material.

Motion failed, with Members Allen, Johnson, Stokes, Thomas, Warner and Wright in favor, and Members Belnap, Castle, Corry, Cummins, Crandall, Hansen, Huntsman and Lockhart opposed.

MOTION was made by Member Belnap and seconded by Member Huntsman that the material be made available for Board members to review and the item brought back next month.

Motion carried unanimously.

Suicide Prevention Report

An annual report to the legislature regarding suicide prevention programs and the Board's coordination efforts with the Department of Health and state suicide prevention coordinator is required. The Committee received the report.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve the report for presentation to the Education Interim Committee.

Motion carried unanimously.

Secondary Social Studies Standards Revision

The Committee received a sampling of the revision. The revised standards will come to the committee in December.

FINANCE COMMITTEE

Committee Vice Chair Mark Huntsman reported on the following items from the Committee.

Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes

The Committee approved the minutes from the September 17, 2015 meeting.

Free or Reduced Lunch Information Update

The Committee received information on free and reduced lunch as requested.

LEA Audits from FY 2014

The Committee reviewed a summary of FY 2014 financial statements, single audits and management letters of all LEAs that were operational during FY 14. All LEAs fulfilled statutory requirements to obtain a financial statement audit.

State Fiscal Year (SFY) 2016 Budget Reporting

The Committee received budget reports and updates from the Utah State Office of Rehabilitation, Utah State Office of Education (USOE), USOE Administration, USOE Teaching and Learning Section and USOE Special Education Section.

Associate Superintendent Jones showed the Board how to access the budget information through the Common Operating Picture placed on the extranet site.

SFY 15 Carry Forward and SFY 16 Discretionary Funds Requested Spend Plan

Three additional requests for use of discretionary funds were presented. The Committee did not vote on this item pending the presentation of more details.

Associate Superintendent Jones reviewed the additional requests: \$10,000, Education Excellence Commission; \$11,000, EIMAC; and \$35,000, Schools to Watch program. He clarified that the \$10,000 for the Education Excellence Commission is to match what UCAT, the Board of Regents, and Governor's Office is paying to retaining the University of Utah's Education Policy Center to facilitate the creation of a ten-year education plan.

Vice Chair Thomas expressed some concern about what he has seen of the ten-year education master plan. Superintendent Smith reported that the original plan has been revised and is now on a very different trajectory.

MOTION was made by Member Huntsman and seconded by Member Castle that the Board approve use of the discretionary funds for the Education Excellence Commission, EIMAC and Schools to Watch in the amounts presented.

Deputy Superintendent Dickson informed that the Schools to Watch program supports middle school teachers and recognizes specific middle schools that are engaging in promising practices.

Associate Superintendent Nye explained that EIMAC is an education consortium that looks at the interaction of information technology, data security, data privacy and assessment. The funding is for membership in the consortium.

Motion carried unanimously.

Governor's Office of Management and Budget Preparation Process

The Committee received the SFY 17 budget preparation timeline and was informed that the agency is on target to meet the October 14 deadline.

Key Finance and Accounting Positions

It was reported that Kristine Rasmussen has been hired as the Internal Accounting Director and will start October 13. Interviews for three managerial accountants and one compliance officer will be conducted after she has started.

Legislative Intent Language Reports

Two intent language reports are due to the legislative interim committee by October 31 and three additional reports are due by mid-November. The reports are in the process of being finalized and draft reports will be sent to the Finance Committee and Board Executive Committee for review prior to presentation before the legislature.

Requests for Information

School Finance is working on a schedule for LEAs to provide them with a list of due dates for reports to the Utah State Office of Education throughout the year.

Vice Chair Johnson requested that the USOE superintendency make a recommendation for consistency on how to claim unallocated expenses between sections. She also requested a contact/information report of the membership of audit committees for every LEA.

MOTION from Committee that the Board request an Attorney General opinion to determine if school districts are required to bus students who are beyond boundary limits.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Lockhart that the Board receive legal counsel from its attorney on this issue.

Member Warner asked what the concern is. Member Wright reported that the Alpine District business manager has discussed with him the frustration in districts that parents feel they are entitled to busing. Utah statute directs that the state fund transportation at 85 percent subject to available resources. The additional costs districts are paying for busing are taking resources from other areas. Districts would like to consider not busing students and want to know if that is within the law.

Superintendent Smith expressed support for the Board receiving information from its counsel, but cautioned that districts are independent entities capable of having their own legal counsel advise them. If this is a significant issue they have a vehicle themselves to unify and get legal opinions.

Member Corry reported she did not vote in favor of the motion in Committee because she feels it is a local issue. Member Allen concurred, suggesting that districts need to come together if they feel it is important.

Vice Chair Johnson called the question on the amendment. Without objection, the motion was put to a vote.

Motion to amend carried, with Members Allen, Crandall, Cummins, Johnson, Lockhart, Stokes, Thomas, Warner and Wright in favor, and Members Belnap, Castle, Corry, Hansen and Huntsman opposed.

Member Cummins asked for what the information would be used. Member Stokes indicated school busing is the only question he's been asked about and it would be good to have that information.

Member Castle expressed discomfort with the Board receiving legal counsel that could

then be used by the school districts.

Member Allen commented that until the Board has the answers to the question the problem can't be solved, and school districts aren't being adequately funded for transportation.

Associate Superintendent Stallings reported that she researched this issue a couple of years ago when she worked for the legislature, and gave the following information to the Board. There is nothing in statute that requires a district to provide transportation for students; there is a formula for purposes of funding transportation. Any mandates come from court cases. It is the school district that needs to make the determination on providing equal access to education. Superintendent Stallings cautioned that if the Board asks its attorney to provide legal counsel, it will need to be clear for what the research will be used. Other questions to consider are whether transportation needs to be funded at a higher level and how charter schools are affected.

Motion to request legal counsel on the issue failed, with Members Allen, Johnson, Lockhart, Stokes and Wright in favor, and Members Belnap, Castle, Corry, Cummins, Crandall, Hansen, Huntsman, Thomas and Warner opposed.

Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Brad Smith reported on the following.

- Sheryl Garner, the newly-hired project manager for the School Turnaround Project, was introduced. She gave some background regarding her work experience with the Washington D.C. public school system.
- A chart listing schools in the School Turnaround cohort was distributed and reviewed. Superintendent Smith reported that he will be asking for an amendment in R277-920 to exclude schools that are in their first three years. He explained that some specialized schools have also been excluded because the nature of the schools did not make them a good fit. Superintendent Smith also explained that two RFP processes are at work to identify school turnaround experts. He will request Board approval of the turnaround experts in its next meeting, and as the schools select the

- experts, the Board will have an additional opportunity for approval. A second RFP process will be conducted for a leadership academy. Superintendent Smith reported he will be meeting with LEAs regarding their turnaround schools to make sure there is not duplication of effort with what is already happening. He will invite Board members to those meetings.
- Several audits are in process, one pertaining to a potential privacy violation issue. That was addressed very aggressively last week and a meeting was held with the state transparency website staff and LEAs affected, and the issue has almost been completely resolved.
 - Associate Superintendent Nye will be sending to the Board a report regarding kindergarten assessment options.
 - There was some testimony recently in a legislative committee regarding the state longitudinal data system and the fact that USOE applied for and received a four-year federal grant. The grant is for \$1.9 million in year one and \$1.5 million for three subsequent years.
 - Information regarding Utah teacher shortages was reviewed. There is no obvious pattern where there are shortages, and every trend evaluated is contradictory. Additional data is being collected. The highest number of vacancies are for secondary math and science teachers, then special education teachers.
 - USOR Executive Director Darin Brush responded to a question of how many blind or visually impaired individuals are on the Order of Selection waiting list. He reported that in the three categories, 61 are in the Most Significantly Disabled category, 16 in the next category and none in the broadest category. Superintendent Smith commented that he has witnessed a turnaround in USOR, in attitude and in belief systems; it is a credit to the present team and to the Board willing to establish an expectation of performance.
 - Superintendent Smith applauded staff for their work on the Grades 6-8 Science Standards. Through the hard work of staff, the product is substantially better than the one first presented.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

MOTION was made by Member Stokes and seconded by Member Lockhart that the Board move into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing the character, professional competence, or physical or mental health of individuals and pending or reasonably imminent litigation.

Upon voice vote of the members present, the Board moved into Executive Session at 3:40 p.m.

Those present in Executive Session included Board Members Allen, Belnap, Castle, Corry, Cummins, Crandall, Hansen, Huntsman, Johnson, Lockhart, Stokes, Thomas, Warner, and Wright; and Brad Smith, Sydnee Dickson, Lorraine Austin, Nicole Call, and Ben Rasmussen.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Corry that the Board come out of Executive Session.

Motion carried. The Board reconvened in open session at 5:07 p.m.

Executive Session ItemsUtah Professional Practices Advisory Commission (UPPAC) Consent Calendar and Licensing Actions

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Vice Chair Thomas that the Board approve the UPPAC Consent Calendar.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Warner that Cases 14-1240 and 15-38 be removed from the Consent Calendar.

Motion to amend carried.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Huntsman that the Board direct that a hearing be held on Case No. 14-1240.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson that for Case 15-38 staff be directed to gather information from the DCFS LIS database and bring back next month.

Without objection, the direction was given.

MOTION was made by Member Castle and seconded by Vice Chair Johnson that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 14-1184 and suspend the educator's Level 2 Secondary Education License for a period of five years from the date of Board action consistent with the Default Order. Reinstatement, following a UPPAC hearing and recommendation, is subject to Board approval.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Castle and seconded by Member Cummins that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 15-1266 and suspend the educator's Level 1 Secondary Education License for not less than two years with certain conditions from the date of Board action pursuant to a stipulated agreement. Reinstatement, following a UPPAC hearing and recommendation, is subject to Board approval.

Motion carried, with Vice Chair Johnson opposed; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Castle and seconded by Member Warner that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 14-222 and revoke the educator's Level 2 Education License from the date of Board action.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Castle and seconded by Member Belnap that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 14-1233 and revoke the educator's Level 1 Education License.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by member Castle and seconded by Member Belnap that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 14-1229 and revoke the educator's Level 1 Elementary Education License.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Castle and seconded by Member Belnap that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 04-691 and deny reinstatement.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Castle and seconded by Member Corry that the Board

accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 12-1063 and reinstate the Petitioner's license with the conditions set forth in the UPPAC hearing report.

Motion carried, with Member Belnap and Vice Chair Johnson opposed; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Castle and seconded by Member Corry that the Board accept UPPAC's recommendation in case No. 91-251 and approve reinstatement of the Petitioner's license with conditions.

Motion failed, with Members Corry, Cummins, Lockhart, Hansen, Stokes and Thomas in favor, and Members Belnap, Castle, Crandall, Huntsman, Johnson, Warner, and Wright opposed; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Lockhart that the Board reject the request for reinstatement in Case No. 91-251 and request that further findings be provided next month.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Castle and seconded by Member Warner that in UPPAC Case No. 14-1246 the Board reject the UPPAC recommendation and suspend the Petitioner's license for no less than two years from the date of Board action.

Motion carried. As this approval is different than the UPPAC recommendation, staff will prepare findings and bring back next month.

MOTION was made by Member Castle and seconded by Vice Chair Johnson that the Board accept UPPAC's recommendation in Case No. 13-1116 and revoke the educator's Level 2 Elementary Education License.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

Utah Statewide Independent Living Council Appointments

MOTION was made by Member Hansen and seconded by Vice Chair Johnson that the Board appoint the following to the Utah Statewide Independent Living Council:

- Robert Ferris, Andrea Pitts, Lester Ruesch, and Richard Luke - representing persons with a disability, for terms October 1, 2015 through September 30, 2018.

- Isabel Gardet - representing persons with a disability, for a term October 1, 2015 through September 30, 2016.
- Michael Lefevor - representing youth with a disability, for a term October 1, 2015 through September 30, 2018.
- Jennie Ostermiller - representing persons with or without a disability, for a term October 1, 2015 through September 30, 2018.
- Nancy Bentley - representing the Association of Independent Living Utah, for a term October 1, 2015 through September 30, 2016.
- Tara Rollins - ex-officio member representing the Utah Housing Coalition, for a term October 1, 2015 through September 30, 2018.
- Tom England - ex-officio member representing the Utah State Office of Rehabilitation, for a term October 1, 2015 through September 30, 2018.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

Public Educator Evaluation Requirements (PEER) Committee Appointment

MOTION was made by Member Hansen and seconded by Member Huntsman that the Board appoint Dr. Ember Conley to the PEER Committee, representing district superintendents.

Motion carried; Member Allen absent.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION was made by Vice Chair Johnson and seconded by Member Huntsman that the meeting adjourn.

Motion carried. The meeting adjourned at 5:20 p.m.

Lorraine Austin, Board Secretary
Minutes approved November 6, 2015